



Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

Thursday, November 19, 2009

LEGAL ACTION REPORT
(*REVISED)

1. Call to Order / Roll Call: 1:03 p.m.

Commissioners: Terry Majewski, Demion Clinco, Bill Mackey, Gal Witmer, Patsy Waterfall,
Kathy Nabours, Sharon Chadwick

Staff: Frank S. Podgorski, Michael Taku, Jonathan Mabry, Aline Torres

2. Regular Cases:

HPZ 09-42 Blair-New Construction (Residence) (Revised); 711 North 7th Avenue (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Mr. David Blair, property owner, on the proposed in-fill duplex residential proposal located in the West University Historic Preservation Zone. Mr. Blair was asked to return with several details on his plans after initial review by commissioners at the November 12, 2009, plans review meeting. Included in his revised elevation drawings are the removal of corbels/arches and the addition of fascia boards on the roof rafter tails. Commissioners reviewed the mass of the residence in the field and deemed it to be in compliance with the historic ordinance.

Motion by Demion Clinco to recommend approval as revised and submitted.

Seconded by Sharon Chadwick with the amended condition that Mr. Blair return for a "minor review" for colors and landscaping.

Motion passed unanimously as amended. Vote 6-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

.....

HPZ 09-44 Goodrich-Demolition (Accessory Structure); 701-707 East University Boulevard (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Tony Reed, representing the property owners, on the proposed demolition of an existing detached accessory structure located in the rear yard of a quadriplex residential structure in the West University Historic Preservation Zone. Mr. Reed discussed the engineering report submitted by George R. Stevenson, Jr., Structural Concepts, Inc. and the City of Tucson's acting Building Official's report on the condition of the accessory building. The condition is unsafe and unusable as a garage or dwelling if rehabilitation were to occur. The property owners would prefer to invest the money for rehabilitation of this structure into

rehabilitation of the principal dwelling; specifically windows and doors. Discussion amongst the commissioners who generally were sympathetic towards demolition but some warned that "demolition by neglect" was not an option to rehabilitation for any historic structure. Based on the zoning of the property, it is not feasible to convert the structure to an additional dwelling without seeking variances.

Motion by Gal Witmer to recommend demolition of the accessory structure with the condition that the money saved on its rehabilitation be invested into the rehabilitation of the windows on the principal dwelling.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed. Vote 4-2. Chair Majewski did not vote.

HPZ 08-05 Quatrovest-New Construction (Residence) (Revised Plan); 330 East Speedway Boulevard (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Mike Finklestein, developer, on the construction of a single-family residential in-fill project located in the West University Historic Preservation Zone. Discussion on the details of the plan. Commissioners agreed that the shed roof on the front porch should be removed as this is the most prominent elevation (north) along Speedway Boulevard. Mr. Finklestein proposes to leave the east elevation wall of the residence blank without window fenestration. Commissioners discussed other design elements including the shed roof on the front porch.

Motion by Demion Clinco to revise the elevations with the following design elements: 1) install a hip end on the front porch roof; 2) review the windows on the front (north) elevation; 3) eliminate the "seat wall" on the front elevation; 4) show window/door fenestration on the east (side) elevation; 5) include a landscape plan; and, 4) show at least an 8"-12" stem wall on the north (front) and west (side) elevations.

Seconded by Patsy Waterfall.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 6-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

.....

3. Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone:

RND 09-05 Rialto Block-Façade Improvements; 300 East Congress Street (Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone)

Presentation by Bill Jones, representing the property owners, on the façade improvements to a National Register listed building using state grant funds. The slab of the building will have to be adjusted to accommodate a 2 ½" difference between the Congress Street sidewalk and a 4" difference between the Fifth Street sidewalk. Commissioners reviewed all the details on the submitted plan and discussed changes necessary for recommendation to the Director.

Motion by Demion Clinco to recommend approval for the following details:

1. (*REVISED) Removal of the horizontal mullions flanking the door (northwest store front entryway) but not the mullion and transom window above the door;
2. Use marble not concrete for the wainscoting;
3. Install prismatic glass above storefronts;
4. Rebuild northwest corner store front entryway as approved as shown on the approved plan dated May 4, 2009 and (*REVISED) with prismatic glass transom windows located at the street façade (consistent with the other openings) with a bead board soffit ceiling;
5. Remove fabric sunshade on the north façade or move it to the west façade or change all of them to match.

Seconded by Patsy Waterfall.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 6-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

City staff recommends the applicant return to the Plans Review Subcommittee with the following details on a revised set of plans:

1. Show the temporary door configuration at the 316 East Congress Street storefront;
2. Show the 314 East Congress Street storefront matching the 302-312 East Congress Street storefronts;
3. Show the prismatic glass in actual configuration as proposed for all storefronts;
4. Remove the reference to "alt concrete" from the "typical keynotes" and substitute "marble for all storefronts";
5. Install prismatic glass with a soffit on the northwest storefront of the building located at 300 East Congress Street as approved on the May 4, 2009 plan and describe the glass detail on the "typical keynotes";
6. Remove glass mullions above the window panes of all storefronts, and;
7. Return for review/recommendation on the northwest corner roof parapets in response to previous plans review comments or include a roof parapet rehabilitation proposal.

4. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:

- a. Minor Reviews: HPZ 09-49 Conners-Fence/Gates/Rear Porch; 215 East University Boulevard (West University Historic Preservation Zone)
- b. Appeals: No appeals at this time.
- c. Zoning Violations: Zoning violations in historic preservation zones are reported to the Code Enforcement Section of Community Services Department at 792-CITY. If a city inspector confirms a violation, the property owner is referred to the historic review/approval process at Planning & Development Services Department in order to abate the violation.
- d. Historic Preservation Zone Development Standards: Jonathan Mabry, COT, Historic Program Manager, reported that city staff has been tasked with including the demolition process for structures throughout the city limits older than 50 years in the Land Use Code. The process will be designed by staff to prevent significant delay on an applicant's ability to obtain a demolition permit after review for any historic significance.

5. Call to the audience: No one to speak.
6. Meeting adjourned at 3:41 p.m.

